

# Two-sided multiplications and phantom line bundles

Ilja Gogić

Department of Mathematics  
University of Zagreb

19th Geometrical Seminar  
Zlatibor, Serbia  
August 28–September 4, 2016

joint work with Richard M. Timoney (TCD)  
arXiv:1601.06848

# Preliminaries

## $C^*$ -algebraic formulation of Quantum Mechanics

In quantum mechanics a physical system is typically described via a unital  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  with unit element.

- The self-adjoint elements of  $A$  are thought of as the observables; they are the measurable quantities of the system.
- A state of the system is defined as a positive functional on  $A$  (i.e. a linear map  $\omega : A \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$  such that  $\omega(a^*a) \geq 0$  for all  $a \in A$ ) with  $\omega(1_A) = 1$ . If the system is in the state  $\omega$ , then  $\omega(a)$  is the expected value of the observable  $a$ .
- Automorphisms correspond to the symmetries, while one-parameter automorphism groups describe the reversible time evolution of the system (in the Heisenberg picture).

## Definition

A  **$C^*$ -algebra** is a (complex) Banach  $*$ -algebra  $A$  whose norm  $\| \cdot \|$  satisfies the  $C^*$ -identity. More precisely:

- $A$  is a Banach algebra over the field  $\mathbb{C}$ .
- $A$  is equipped with an involution, i.e. a map  $*$  :  $A \rightarrow A$ ,  $a \mapsto a^*$  satisfying the properties:

$$(\alpha a + \beta b)^* = \bar{\alpha} a^* + \bar{\beta} b^*, \quad (ab)^* = b^* a^*, \quad \text{and} \quad (a^*)^* = a,$$

for all  $a, b \in A$  and  $\alpha, \beta \in \mathbb{C}$ .

- Norm  $\| \cdot \|$  satisfies the  **$C^*$ -identity**, i.e.

$$\|a^* a\| = \|a\|^2$$

for all  $a \in A$ .

## Remark

The  $C^*$ -identity is a very strong requirement. For instance, together with the spectral radius formula, it implies that the  $C^*$ -norm is uniquely determined by the algebraic structure: For all  $a \in A$  we have

$$\|a\|^2 = \|a^*a\| = \sup\{|\lambda| : \lambda \in \text{spec}(a^*a)\}.$$

## Remark

The  $C^*$ -identity is a very strong requirement. For instance, together with the spectral radius formula, it implies that the  $C^*$ -norm is uniquely determined by the algebraic structure: For all  $a \in A$  we have

$$\|a\|^2 = \|a^*a\| = \sup\{|\lambda| : \lambda \in \text{spec}(a^*a)\}.$$

In the category of  $C^*$ -algebras, the natural morphisms are the **\*-homomorphisms**, i.e. the algebra homomorphisms which preserve the involution. They are automatically contractive.

## Remark

The  $C^*$ -identity is a very strong requirement. For instance, together with the spectral radius formula, it implies that the  $C^*$ -norm is uniquely determined by the algebraic structure: For all  $a \in A$  we have

$$\|a\|^2 = \|a^*a\| = \sup\{|\lambda| : \lambda \in \text{spec}(a^*a)\}.$$

In the category of  $C^*$ -algebras, the natural morphisms are the **\*-homomorphisms**, i.e. the algebra homomorphisms which preserve the involution. They are automatically contractive.

## Example

Let  $X$  be a LCH (locally compact Hausdorff) space and let  $C_0(X)$  be the set of all continuous complex-valued functions on  $X$  that vanish at  $\infty$ . Then  $C_0(X)$  becomes a commutative  $C^*$ -algebra with respect to the pointwise operations, involution  $f^*(x) := \overline{f(x)}$ , and max-norm  $\|f\|_\infty := \sup\{|f(x)| : x \in X\}$ . Obviously,  $C_0(X)$  is unital if and only if  $X$  is compact.

In fact, all unital commutative  $C^*$ -algebras arise in this fashion:

### Theorem (Gelfand-Naimark, 1943)

*The (contravariant) functor  $X \rightsquigarrow C_0(X)$  defines an equivalence of categories of LCH spaces (with proper maps as morphisms) and commutative  $C^*$ -algebras (with non-degenerate  $*$ -homomorphisms as morphisms).*

In fact, all unital commutative  $C^*$ -algebras arise in this fashion:

### Theorem (Gelfand-Naimark, 1943)

*The (contravariant) functor  $X \rightsquigarrow C_0(X)$  defines an equivalence of categories of LCH spaces (with proper maps as morphisms) and commutative  $C^*$ -algebras (with non-degenerate  $*$ -homomorphisms as morphisms).*

In other words: By passing from the space  $X$  the function algebra  $C_0(X)$ , no information is lost. In fact,  $X$  can be recovered from  $C_0(X)$ . Thus, topological properties of  $X$  can be translated into algebraic properties of  $C_0(X)$ , and vice versa, so the theory of  $C^*$ -algebras is often thought of as **noncommutative topology**.



## Basic examples

- The set  $\mathbb{B}(\mathcal{H})$  of bounded linear operators on a Hilbert space  $\mathcal{H}$  becomes a  $C^*$ -algebra with respect to the standard operations, usual adjoint and operator norm. In particular, the complex matrix algebras  $M_n(\mathbb{C})$  are  $C^*$ -algebras.
- In fact, every  $C^*$ -algebra can be isometrically embedded as a norm-closed self-adjoint subalgebra of  $\mathbb{B}(\mathcal{H})$  for some Hilbert space  $\mathcal{H}$  (the noncommutative Gelfand-Naimark theorem).
- To every locally compact group  $G$ , one can associate a  $C^*$ -algebra  $C^*(G)$ . Everything about the representation theory of  $G$  is encoded in  $C^*(G)$ .
- The category of  $C^*$ -algebras is closed under the formation of direct products, direct sums, extensions, direct limits, pullbacks, pushouts, (some) tensor products, etc.

In the light of noncommutative topology it is natural to try to view a given  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  as a set of sections of some sort of the bundle. The natural candidate for the base space  $X$  is the primitive spectrum of  $A$ :

In the light of noncommutative topology it is natural to try to view a given  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  as a set of sections of some sort of the bundle. The natural candidate for the base space  $X$  is the primitive spectrum of  $A$ :

### Definition

An ideal  $P$  of  $A$  is said to be **primitive** if  $P$  is the kernel of some irreducible representation of  $A$ . The **primitive spectrum** of  $A$ , which we denote by  $\text{Prim}(A)$ , is the set of all primitive ideals of  $A$  equipped with the Jacobson topology. Hence, if  $S$  is some set of primitive ideals, its closure is

$$\bar{S} = \left\{ P \in \text{Prim}(A) : P \supseteq \bigcap_{Q \in S} Q \right\}.$$

In the light of noncommutative topology it is natural to try to view a given  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  as a set of sections of some sort of the bundle. The natural candidate for the base space  $X$  is the primitive spectrum of  $A$ :

### Definition

An ideal  $P$  of  $A$  is said to be **primitive** if  $P$  is the kernel of some irreducible representation of  $A$ . The **primitive spectrum** of  $A$ , which we denote by  $\text{Prim}(A)$ , is the set of all primitive ideals of  $A$  equipped with the Jacobson topology. Hence, if  $S$  is some set of primitive ideals, its closure is

$$\bar{S} = \left\{ P \in \text{Prim}(A) : P \supseteq \bigcap_{Q \in S} Q \right\}.$$

### The good news

The primitive ideals separate the points of  $A$ . Further,  $\text{Prim}(A)$  is a locally compact space.

In the light of noncommutative topology it is natural to try to view a given  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  as a set of sections of some sort of the bundle. The natural candidate for the base space  $X$  is the primitive spectrum of  $A$ :

### Definition

An ideal  $P$  of  $A$  is said to be **primitive** if  $P$  is the kernel of some irreducible representation of  $A$ . The **primitive spectrum** of  $A$ , which we denote by  $\text{Prim}(A)$ , is the set of all primitive ideals of  $A$  equipped with the Jacobson topology. Hence, if  $S$  is some set of primitive ideals, its closure is

$$\bar{S} = \left\{ P \in \text{Prim}(A) : P \supseteq \bigcap_{Q \in S} Q \right\}.$$

### The good news

The primitive ideals separate the points of  $A$ . Further,  $\text{Prim}(A)$  is a locally compact space.

### The bad news

$\text{Prim}(A)$  in general satisfies only  $T_0$ -separation axiom.

# Approximations by elementary operators

Let  $IB(A)$  be the set of all bounded maps  $\phi : A \rightarrow A$  that preserve (closed two-sided) ideals of  $A$ , i.e.  $\phi(I) \subseteq I$  for all ideals  $I$  of  $A$ .

- For any ideal  $I$  of  $A$ ,  $\phi$  induces a map  $\phi_I : A/I \rightarrow A/I$  which sends  $a + I$  to  $\phi(a) + I$ .
- If  $S$  is any subset of ideals of  $A$  with zero intersection, the norm of  $\phi$  can be computed by the formula  $\|\phi\| = \sup\{\|\phi_I\| : I \in S\}$ .

## Approximations by elementary operators

Let  $IB(A)$  be the set of all bounded maps  $\phi : A \rightarrow A$  that preserve (closed two-sided) ideals of  $A$ , i.e.  $\phi(I) \subseteq I$  for all ideals  $I$  of  $A$ .

- For any ideal  $I$  of  $A$ ,  $\phi$  induces a map  $\phi_I : A/I \rightarrow A/I$  which sends  $a + I$  to  $\phi(a) + I$ .
- If  $S$  is any subset of ideals of  $A$  with zero intersection, the norm of  $\phi$  can be computed by the formula  $\|\phi\| = \sup\{\|\phi_I\| : I \in S\}$ .

The most prominent class of maps  $\phi \in IB(A)$  are the **elementary operators**, i.e. those that can be expressed as finite sums of two-sided multiplication maps  $M_{a,b} : x \mapsto axb$ , where  $a$  and  $b$  are elements of  $A$  (or more generally  $M(A)$ —the multiplier algebra of  $A$ ).

## Approximations by elementary operators

Let  $\text{IB}(A)$  be the set of all bounded maps  $\phi : A \rightarrow A$  that preserve (closed two-sided) ideals of  $A$ , i.e.  $\phi(I) \subseteq I$  for all ideals  $I$  of  $A$ .

- For any ideal  $I$  of  $A$ ,  $\phi$  induces a map  $\phi_I : A/I \rightarrow A/I$  which sends  $a + I$  to  $\phi(a) + I$ .
- If  $S$  is any subset of ideals of  $A$  with zero intersection, the norm of  $\phi$  can be computed by the formula  $\|\phi\| = \sup\{\|\phi_I\| : I \in S\}$ .

The most prominent class of maps  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  are the **elementary operators**, i.e. those that can be expressed as finite sums of two-sided multiplication maps  $M_{a,b} : x \mapsto axb$ , where  $a$  and  $b$  are elements of  $A$  (or more generally  $M(A)$ —the multiplier algebra of  $A$ ).

The important observation is that elementary operators are in fact completely bounded, i.e.  $\sup_n \|\phi^{(n)}\| < \infty$ , where for each  $n$ ,  $\phi^{(n)} : M_n(A) \rightarrow M_n(A)$  is the induced map that sends the matrix  $[a_{ij}]$  to the matrix  $[\phi(a_{ij})]$ .



More precisely, we have the following estimate

$$\left\| \sum_i M_{a_i, b_i} \right\|_{cb} \leq \left\| \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\|_h, \quad (1)$$

where  $\|\cdot\|_h$  is the Haagerup tensor norm on  $M(A) \otimes M(A)$ , i.e.

$$\|t\|_h = \inf \left\{ \left\| \sum_i a_i a_i^* \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left\| \sum_i b_i^* b_i \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} : t = \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\}.$$

More precisely, we have the following estimate

$$\left\| \sum_i M_{a_i, b_i} \right\|_{cb} \leq \left\| \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\|_h, \quad (1)$$

where  $\| \cdot \|_h$  is the Haagerup tensor norm on  $M(A) \otimes M(A)$ , i.e.

$$\|t\|_h = \inf \left\{ \left\| \sum_i a_i a_i^* \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left\| \sum_i b_i^* b_i \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} : t = \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\}.$$

### Theorem (Haagerup 1980, Chatterjee-Sinclair 1992, Mathieu 2003)

*The equality in (1) holds true for all elementary operators  $\phi = \sum_i M_{a_i, b_i}$  if and only if  $A$  is a prime  $C^*$ -algebra.*

More precisely, we have the following estimate

$$\left\| \sum_i M_{a_i, b_i} \right\|_{cb} \leq \left\| \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\|_h, \quad (1)$$

where  $\|\cdot\|_h$  is the Haagerup tensor norm on  $M(A) \otimes M(A)$ , i.e.

$$\|t\|_h = \inf \left\{ \left\| \sum_i a_i a_i^* \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left\| \sum_i b_i^* b_i \right\|^{\frac{1}{2}} : t = \sum_i a_i \otimes b_i \right\}.$$

### Theorem (Haagerup 1980, Chatterjee-Sinclair 1992, Mathieu 2003)

The equality in (1) holds true for all elementary operators  $\phi = \sum_i M_{a_i, b_i}$  if and only if  $A$  is a prime  $C^*$ -algebra.

### Remark

If the algebra  $A$  is not prime, then the map  $a \otimes b \mapsto M_{a,b}$  is not even injective.

The **length** of an elementary operator  $\phi \neq 0$  is the smallest positive integer  $\ell = \ell(\phi)$  such that  $\phi = \sum_{i=1}^{\ell} M_{a_i, b_i}$  for some  $a_i, b_i \in M(A)$ . We also define  $\ell(0) = 0$ .

The **length** of an elementary operator  $\phi \neq 0$  is the smallest positive integer  $l = l(\phi)$  such that  $\phi = \sum_{i=1}^l M_{a_i, b_i}$  for some  $a_i, b_i \in M(A)$ . We also define  $l(0) = 0$ .

By  $\mathcal{E}l(A)$  we denote the set of all elementary operators on  $A$  and by  $\mathcal{E}l_k(A)$  the set of all  $\phi \in \mathcal{E}l(A)$  with  $l(\phi) \leq k$ .

The **length** of an elementary operator  $\phi \neq 0$  is the smallest positive integer  $\ell = \ell(\phi)$  such that  $\phi = \sum_{i=1}^{\ell} M_{a_i, b_i}$  for some  $a_i, b_i \in M(A)$ . We also define  $\ell(0) = 0$ .

By  $\mathcal{E}l(A)$  we denote the set of all elementary operators on  $A$  and by  $\mathcal{E}l_k(A)$  the set of all  $\phi \in \mathcal{E}l(A)$  with  $\ell(\phi) \leq k$ .

### Theorem (Timoney 2003, 2007)

For every  $\phi \in \mathcal{E}l(A)$  of length  $\ell$  we have

$$\|\phi\|_{cb} = \|\phi^{(\ell)}\| \leq \sqrt{\ell} \|\phi\|.$$

The **length** of an elementary operator  $\phi \neq 0$  is the smallest positive integer  $\ell = \ell(\phi)$  such that  $\phi = \sum_{i=1}^{\ell} M_{a_i, b_i}$  for some  $a_i, b_i \in M(A)$ . We also define  $\ell(0) = 0$ .

By  $\mathcal{E}\ell(A)$  we denote the set of all elementary operators on  $A$  and by  $\mathcal{E}\ell_k(A)$  the set of all  $\phi \in \mathcal{E}\ell(A)$  with  $\ell(\phi) \leq k$ .

### Theorem (Timoney 2003, 2007)

For every  $\phi \in \mathcal{E}\ell(A)$  of length  $\ell$  we have

$$\|\phi\|_{cb} = \|\phi^{(\ell)}\| \leq \sqrt{\ell} \|\phi\|.$$

### Corollary

On each  $\mathcal{E}\ell_k(A)$  the  $cb$ -norm is equivalent to the operator norm.

## Question

Which operators  $\phi \in IB(A)$  can be approximated by elementary operators in the operator norm?



## Question

Which operators  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  can be approximated by elementary operators in the operator norm?

## Theorem (Magajna 2009)

*If  $A$  is a separable  $C^*$ -algebra, then  $\mathcal{E}\ell(A)$  is operator norm dense in  $\text{IB}(A)$  if and only if  $A$  can be decomposed as a finite direct sum  $A = A_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus A_n$ , where each summand  $A_i$  is homogeneous with the finite type property. In particular, in this case we have  $\text{IB}(A) = \mathcal{E}\ell(A)$ .*

## Question

Which operators  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  can be approximated by elementary operators in the operator norm?

## Theorem (Magajna 2009)

*If  $A$  is a separable  $C^*$ -algebra, then  $\mathcal{E}\ell(A)$  is operator norm dense in  $\text{IB}(A)$  if and only if  $A$  can be decomposed as a finite direct sum  $A = A_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus A_n$ , where each summand  $A_i$  is homogeneous with the finite type property. In particular, in this case we have  $\text{IB}(A) = \mathcal{E}\ell(A)$ .*

## Remark

- A  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  is called  **$n$ -homogeneous** if  $A/P \cong \mathbb{M}_n$  for every  $P \in \text{Prim}(A)$ . By a well-known theorem of Fell and Tomiyama-Takesaki, for any  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$  with (primitive) spectrum  $X$  there is a locally trivial bundle  $\mathcal{E}$  over  $X$  with fibre  $\mathbb{M}_n$  and structure group  $\text{Aut}(\mathbb{M}_n) = \text{PU}(n) = \text{U}(n)/\mathbb{S}^1$  such that  $A$  is isomorphic to the algebra  $\Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  of sections of  $\mathcal{E}$  which vanish at infinity.

## Remark (continuation)

- Moreover, any two such algebras  $A_i = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E}_i)$  with spectra  $X_i$  are isomorphic if and only if there is a homeomorphism  $f : X_1 \rightarrow X_2$  such that  $\mathcal{E}_1 \cong f^*(\mathcal{E}_2)$  as bundles over  $X_1$ .
- An  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra  $\Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  with spectrum  $X$  is said to have the finite type property if  $\mathcal{E}$  can be trivialized over some finite open cover of  $X$ .

## Remark (continuation)

- Moreover, any two such algebras  $A_i = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E}_i)$  with spectra  $X_i$  are isomorphic if and only if there is a homeomorphism  $f : X_1 \rightarrow X_2$  such that  $\mathcal{E}_1 \cong f^*(\mathcal{E}_2)$  as bundles over  $X_1$ .
- An  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra  $\Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  with spectrum  $X$  is said to have the finite type property if  $\mathcal{E}$  can be trivialized over some finite open cover of  $X$ .

## Theorem (G. 2011)

Let  $A$  be a separable  $C^*$ -algebra.

- If  $\mathcal{E}l(A)$  is norm closed, then  $A$  is necessarily subhomogeneous (i.e.  $\sup\{\dim(A/P) : P \in \text{Prim}(A)\} < \infty$ ) and each homogeneous sub-quotient of  $A$  has the finite type property.*
- The converse is also true if  $\text{Prim}(A)$  is Hausdorff.*
- There exists a compact subset  $X$  of  $\mathbb{R}$  and a unital  $C^*$ -subalgebra  $A$  of  $C(X, \mathbb{M}_2)$  such that  $\mathcal{E}l(A)$  is not closed in the operator norm.*

# Approximations by two-sided multiplications

## Notation

Let  $\text{TM}(A) = \{M_{a,b} : a, b \in A\}$  and let  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$  be its (operator) norm closure.

# Approximations by two-sided multiplications

## Notation

Let  $\text{TM}(A) = \{M_{a,b} : a, b \in A\}$  and let  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$  be its (operator) norm closure.

## Problem

Describe  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$ .

# Approximations by two-sided multiplications

## Notation

Let  $\text{TM}(A) = \{M_{a,b} : a, b \in A\}$  and let  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$  be its (operator) norm closure.

## Problem

Describe  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$ .

## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Suppose that  $a, b, c$  and  $d$  are norm-one elements of a  $C^*$ -algebra  $A$ . If

$$\|a \otimes b - c \otimes d\|_h < \varepsilon \leq 1/3,$$

then there exists a scalar  $\mu$  of modulus one such that

$$\max\{\|a - \mu c\|, \|b - \bar{\mu}d\|\} < 6\varepsilon.$$

Consequently,  $\text{TM}(A)$  is norm closed if  $A$  is a prime  $C^*$ -algebra.

In the sequel  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  will be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with the primitive spectrum  $X$ .

### Proposition

*For every  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  the norm function  $x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|$  is continuous on  $X$ . In particular, for each  $\phi \in \overline{\text{TM}(A)}$  we have  $(x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|) \in C_0(X)$ .*



In the sequel  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  will be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with the primitive spectrum  $X$ .

### Proposition

*For every  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  the norm function  $x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|$  is continuous on  $X$ . In particular, for each  $\phi \in \overline{\text{TM}(A)}$  we have  $(x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|) \in C_0(X)$ .*

The next set may seem as the most obvious candidate for the norm closure of  $\text{TM}(A)$ :

### Notation

$\text{PTM}(A) := \{\phi \in \text{IB}(A) : (x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|) \in C_0(X) \ \& \ \phi_x \in \text{TM}(A_x) \ \forall x \in X\}$ .

In the sequel  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  will be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with the primitive spectrum  $X$ .

### Proposition

*For every  $\phi \in \text{IB}(A)$  the norm function  $x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|$  is continuous on  $X$ . In particular, for each  $\phi \in \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$  we have  $(x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|) \in C_0(X)$ .*

The next set may seem as the most obvious candidate for the norm closure of  $\text{TM}(A)$ :

### Notation

$\text{PTM}(A) := \{\phi \in \text{IB}(A) : (x \mapsto \|\phi_x\|) \in C_0(X) \ \& \ \phi_x \in \text{TM}(A_x) \ \forall x \in X\}$ .

### Proposition

*If  $A$  is a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra, then the set  $\text{PTM}(A)$  is norm closed. In particular, we have  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} \subseteq \text{PTM}(A)$ .*

## Problem

Which homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebras  $A$  satisfy the equality  $\overline{\text{TM}(A)} = \text{PTM}(A)$ ?

## Problem

Which homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebras  $A$  satisfy the equality  $\overline{\text{TM}(A)} = \text{PTM}(A)$ ?

## Auxiliary notation

- $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A) = \{\phi \in \text{TM}(A) : \phi_x \neq 0 \forall x \in X\}$ ;
- $\text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) = \{\phi \in \text{PTM}(A) : \text{TM}(A_x) \ni \phi_x \neq 0 \forall x \in X\}$ .

## Problem

Which homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebras  $A$  satisfy the equality  $\overline{\text{TM}(A)} = \text{PTM}(A)$ ?

## Auxiliary notation

- $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A) = \{\phi \in \text{TM}(A) : \phi_x \neq 0 \forall x \in X\}$ ;
- $\text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) = \{\phi \in \text{PTM}(A) : \text{TM}(A_x) \ni \phi_x \neq 0 \forall x \in X\}$ .

## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra. To each operator  $\phi \in \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  we can (canonically) associate a complex line subbundle  $\mathcal{L}_\phi$  of  $\mathcal{E}$  with the property that

$$\phi \in \text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \iff \mathcal{L}_\phi \text{ is a trivial bundle.}$$

Further, if  $X$  is  $\sigma$ -compact, then for every complex line subbundle  $\mathcal{L}$  of  $\mathcal{E}$  we can find an operator  $\phi_{\mathcal{L}} \in \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  such that  $\mathcal{L}_{\phi_{\mathcal{L}}} = \mathcal{L}$ .

If the base space  $X$  is paracompact, then the locally trivial complex line bundles over  $X$  are classified by the homotopy classes from  $X$  to  $\mathbb{C}P^\infty$ , and/or by the elements of the second integral Čech cohomology  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$

If the base space  $X$  is paracompact, then the locally trivial complex line bundles over  $X$  are classified by the homotopy classes from  $X$  to  $\mathbb{C}P^\infty$ , and/or by the elements of the second integral Čech cohomology  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$

For a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  we define a map

$$\theta : \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \rightarrow \check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$$

which sends an operator  $\phi \in \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  to the corresponding class of the bundle  $\mathcal{L}_\phi$  in  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$ . Then  $\theta^{-1}(0) = \text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  (by the latter theorem).

If the base space  $X$  is paracompact, then the locally trivial complex line bundles over  $X$  are classified by the homotopy classes from  $X$  to  $\mathbb{C}P^\infty$ , and/or by the elements of the second integral Čech cohomology  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$

For a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  we define a map

$$\theta : \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \rightarrow \check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$$

which sends an operator  $\phi \in \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  to the corresponding class of the bundle  $\mathcal{L}_\phi$  in  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$ . Then  $\theta^{-1}(0) = \text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  (by the latter theorem).

### Corollary

*Let  $A$  be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra. If  $X = \text{Prim}(A)$  is paracompact with  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z}) = 0$ , then  $\text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) = \text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$ .*



## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $X$  be a CH space with  $\dim X \leq d < \infty$ . For each  $n \geq 1$  let  $A_n = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ . If  $p := \lceil \sqrt{(d+1)/2} \rceil$ , then for every  $n \geq p$  the mapping  $\theta : \text{PTM}_{\text{inv}}(A) \rightarrow \check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$  is surjective. In particular, if  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z}) \neq 0$ , then  $\text{TM}_{\text{inv}}(A_n) \subsetneq \text{PTM}_{\text{inv}}(A_n)$  for all  $n \geq p$ .

## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $X$  be a CH space with  $\dim X \leq d < \infty$ . For each  $n \geq 1$  let  $A_n = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ . If  $p := \lceil \sqrt{(d+1)/2} \rceil$ , then for every  $n \geq p$  the mapping  $\theta : \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \rightarrow \check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$  is surjective. In particular, if  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z}) \neq 0$ , then  $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A_n) \subsetneq \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A_n)$  for all  $n \geq p$ .

## Corollary

If  $X = \mathbb{S}^2$  or  $X = \mathbb{S}^1 \times \mathbb{S}^1$ , then for  $A = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$  we have  $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \subsetneq \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  for all  $n \geq 2$ .

### Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $X$  be a CH space with  $\dim X \leq d < \infty$ . For each  $n \geq 1$  let  $A_n = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ . If  $p := \lceil \sqrt{(d+1)/2} \rceil$ , then for every  $n \geq p$  the mapping  $\theta : \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \rightarrow \check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z})$  is surjective. In particular, if  $\check{H}^2(X; \mathbb{Z}) \neq 0$ , then  $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A_n) \subsetneq \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A_n)$  for all  $n \geq p$ .

### Corollary

If  $X = \mathbb{S}^2$  or  $X = \mathbb{S}^1 \times \mathbb{S}^1$ , then for  $A = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$  we have  $\text{TM}_{\text{nv}}(A) \subsetneq \text{PTM}_{\text{nv}}(A)$  for all  $n \geq 2$ .

### Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with  $X = \text{Prim}(A)$ . Consider the following two conditions:

- (a)  $\forall U \subset X$  open, each complex line subbundle of  $\mathcal{E}|_U$  is trivial.
- (b)  $\text{PTM}(A) = \text{TM}(A)$ .

Then (a)  $\Rightarrow$  (b). If  $A$  is separable, then (a) and (b) are equivalent.

## Corollary

Let  $A$  be an  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with  $n \geq 2$ .

- (a) If  $X$  is second-countable with  $\dim X < 2$ , or if  $X$  is (homeomorphic to) a subset of a non-compact connected 2-manifold, then  $\text{PTM}(A) = \text{TM}(A)$ .
- (b) If  $X$  is  $\sigma$ -compact and contains a nonempty open subset homeomorphic to (an open subset of)  $\mathbb{R}^d$  for some  $d \geq 3$ , then  $\text{PTM}(A) \setminus \text{TM}(A) \neq \emptyset$ .

## Corollary

Let  $A$  be an  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with  $n \geq 2$ .

- (a) If  $X$  is second-countable with  $\dim X < 2$ , or if  $X$  is (homeomorphic to) a subset of a non-compact connected 2-manifold, then  $\text{PTM}(A) = \text{TM}(A)$ .
- (b) If  $X$  is  $\sigma$ -compact and contains a nonempty open subset homeomorphic to (an open subset of)  $\mathbb{R}^d$  for some  $d \geq 3$ , then  $\text{PTM}(A) \setminus \text{TM}(A) \neq \emptyset$ .

## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra. For an operator  $\phi \in B(A)$  the following two conditions are equivalent:

- (a)  $\phi \in \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$ .
- (b)  $\phi \in \text{PTM}(A)$  and for  $\text{coz}(\phi) := \{x \in X : \phi_x \neq 0\}$  the bundle  $\mathcal{L}_\phi$  is trivial on each compact subset of  $\text{coz}(\phi)$ .

## Definition

A locally trivial fibre bundle  $\mathcal{F}$  over a locally compact Hausdorff space  $X$  is said to be a **phantom bundle** if  $\mathcal{F}$  is not globally trivial, but is trivial on each compact subset of  $X$ .

## Definition

A locally trivial fibre bundle  $\mathcal{F}$  over a locally compact Hausdorff space  $X$  is said to be a **phantom bundle** if  $\mathcal{F}$  is not globally trivial, but is trivial on each compact subset of  $X$ .

## Corollary

Let  $A = \Gamma_0(\mathcal{E})$  be a homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra. Then the set  $\text{TM}(A)$  is not norm closed if and only if there exists a  $\sigma$ -compact open subset  $U$  of  $X$  and a phantom subbundle of  $\mathcal{E}|_U$ .

## Remark

Let  $G$  be a group and  $n$  a positive integer. Recall that a space  $X$  is called an **Eilenberg-MacLane** space of type  $K(G, n)$ , if it's  $n$ -th homotopy group  $\pi_n(X)$  is isomorphic to  $G$  and all other homotopy groups trivial. If  $n > 1$  then  $G$  must be abelian (since for all  $n > 1$ , the homotopy groups  $\pi_n(X)$  are abelian). We state some basic facts about Eilenberg-MacLane spaces:

- There exists a CW-complex  $K(G, n)$  for any group  $G$  at  $n = 1$ , and abelian group  $G$  at  $n > 1$ . Moreover such a CW-complex is unique up to homotopy type. Hence, by abuse of notation, it is common to denote any such space by  $K(G, n)$ .
- Given a CW-complex  $X$ , there is a bijection between its cohomology group  $H^n(X; G)$  and the homotopy classes  $[X, K(G, n)]$  of maps from  $X$  to  $K(G, n)$ .
- $K(\mathbb{Z}, 2) \cong \mathbb{C}P^\infty$ . In particular, for each CW-complex  $X$  there is a bijection between  $[X, K(\mathbb{Z}, 2)]$  and isomorphism classes of complex line bundles over  $X$ .



## Example

Let us consider the Eilenberg-MacLane space  $K(\mathbb{Q}, 1)$ .

- The standard model of  $K(\mathbb{Q}, 1)$  is the mapping telescope  $\Delta$  of the sequence

$$\mathbb{S}^1 \xrightarrow{z} \mathbb{S}^1 \xrightarrow{z^2} \mathbb{S}^1 \xrightarrow{z^3} \dots$$

- Applying  $H_1(-; \mathbb{Z})$  to the levels of this mapping telescope gives the system

$$\mathbb{Z} \xrightarrow{\times 1} \mathbb{Z} \xrightarrow{\times 2} \mathbb{Z} \xrightarrow{\times 3} \dots$$

The colimit of this system is  $H_1(\Delta; \mathbb{Z}) = \mathbb{Q}$  and all other integral homology groups are trivial. By the universal coefficient theorem for cohomology each integral cohomology group of  $\Delta$  is trivial, except for  $H^2(\Delta; \mathbb{Z})$  which is isomorphic to  $\text{Ext}(\mathbb{Q}; \mathbb{Z}) \cong \mathbb{R}$ .

- Hence, there exist uncountably many mutually nontrivial complex line bundles over  $X$ . Each such bundle  $\mathcal{L}$  is a phantom bundle, since all restrictions of  $\mathcal{L}$  over finite subcomplexes of  $\Delta$  are trivial.

## Conclusion

Since  $\Delta$  is a 2-complex,  $\mathcal{L}$  is a direct summand of a trivial bundle  $\Delta \times \mathbb{C}^2$ . In particular, if  $A = C_0(\Delta, \mathbb{M}_2)$ , then  $\text{TM}(A)$  is not norm closed.

## Conclusion

Since  $\Delta$  is a 2-complex,  $\mathcal{L}$  is a direct summand of a trivial bundle  $\Delta \times \mathbb{C}^2$ . In particular, if  $A = C_0(\Delta, \mathbb{M}_2)$ , then  $\text{TM}(A)$  is not norm closed.

In private correspondence Prof. Mladen Bestvina (University of Utah) informed us that even inside  $\mathbb{R}^3$  there are open subsets of type  $K(\mathbb{Q}, 1)$ . Using this observation we can show the following fact:

## Theorem (G.-Timoney 2016)

Let  $A$  be an  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with  $n \geq 2$ .

- (a) If  $X$  is second-countable with  $\dim X < 2$  or if  $X$  is (homeomorphic to) a subset of a non-compact connected 2-manifold, then  $\text{TM}(A)$  is not norm closed.
- (b) If there is a nonempty open subset of  $X$  homeomorphic to (an open subset of)  $\mathbb{R}^d$  for some  $d \geq 3$ , then  $\text{TM}(A)$  fails to be norm closed.

## Summary

Let  $A$  be a separable  $n$ -homogeneous  $C^*$ -algebra with  $n \geq 2$  such that  $\dim X = d < \infty$ . If  $X$  is a CW-complex or a subset of a  $d$ -manifold, the following relations between  $\text{TM}(A)$ ,  $\overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}}$  and  $\text{PTM}(A)$  occur:

- (a) If  $d < 2$  we always have  $\text{TM}(A) = \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} = \text{PTM}(A)$ .
- (b) If  $d = 2$  we have four possibilities:
  - (i)  $\text{TM}(A) = \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} = \text{PTM}(A)$ : e.g. if  $X$  is a subset of a non-compact connected 2-manifold
  - (ii)  $\text{TM}(A) = \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} \subsetneq \text{PTM}(A)$ : e.g. if  $A = C(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ , where  $X = \mathbb{S}^2$ .
  - (iii)  $\text{TM}(A) \subsetneq \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} = \text{PTM}(A)$ : e.g. if  $A = C_0(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ , where  $X = \Delta$  is the standard model for  $K(\mathbb{Q}, 1)$ .
  - (iv)  $\text{TM}(A) \subsetneq \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} \subsetneq \text{PTM}(A)$ : e.g. for  $A = C_0(X, \mathbb{M}_n)$ , where  $X$  is the topological disjoint union of  $\mathbb{S}^2$  and  $\Delta$ .
- (c) If  $d > 2$  we always have  $\text{TM}(A) \subsetneq \overline{\overline{\text{TM}(A)}} \subsetneq \text{PTM}(A)$ .